

NEW TITLE IX SCOPE AND DEFINITIONS

Federal Law - Title IX:

No person in the United States shall, on the basis of sex, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefits of, or be subjected to discrimination under any education program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance.

(Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972 (20 U.S.C. Section 1681 et seq.) and related regulations (34 C.F.R. Part 106).)

New Title IX Regulations

1. Regulations and Guidance

- Text of regulations contained in **34 CFR Part 106** have the full force and effect of law

2. Overall Intent of Changes

- Strengthen/Clarify Title IX protections for survivors of sexual misconduct & provide due process protections to those facing accusations of sexual misconduct

3. New Scope Under Title IX Regulations

- Amended sexual harassment definitions, clarified jurisdiction, & confirmed that Title IX sex discrimination includes sexual harassment and other sexual misconduct

4. K-12 Educational Institutions

- February 2020 OCR Enforcement Initiative to combat sexual assault in K-12 schools

Davis v. Monroe County Board of Education

526 U.S. 629 (1999)

- Ruling: For student-on-student sexual harassment, the educational institution will be liable for damages when:
 - The institution has “**actual notice**” of the harassment; and
 - The institution responded to the harassment with “deliberate indifference.”
 - Harassment must be “**severe, pervasive, and objectively offensive,**” and the institution’s indifference was “systemic” so that the victim is deprived of educational opportunities or services.
 - **Deliberate indifference** defined as a response that is “**clearly unreasonable in light of the known circumstances.**”
- The New Regulations apply the *Davis* standard for OCR compliance reviews and for finding institutional liability

Response to Sexual Harassment

According to **34 CFR §106.44(a)**: A recipient with **actual knowledge** of sexual harassment in an education program or activity of the recipient against a person in the United States must **respond promptly in a manner that is not deliberately indifferent** (e.g.; clearly unreasonable in light of the known circumstances.)

Actual Knowledge

- Actual knowledge for **K-12 Educational Institutions** occurs when ***any employee*** has notice of sexual harassment or allegations of sexual harassment.
- Best practice to provide annual training to K-12 employees about reporting responsibilities to the Title IX Coordinator or other designated Title IX Team Member.

Education Program or Activity

- Per § 106.44(a): An education program or activity includes locations, events, or circumstances over which the recipient exercised ***substantial control over both the Respondent and the context in which the sexual harassment occurs***, and also includes any building owned or controlled by a student organization that is officially recognized by a postsecondary institution.
- At time of filing the formal complaint, the Complainant must be participating or attempting to participate in recipient's education program or activity.

Sexual Harassment Defined

According to § 106.30, Sexual Harassment means conduct on the ***basis of sex*** under one or more of following:

1. Quid Pro Quo Harassment

- **Employee** conditions the provision of an aid, benefit, or service of the recipient on the Complainant's participation in unwelcome sexual conduct

2. Hostile Environment Sexual Harassment

- Unwelcome conduct determined by a reasonable person to be **so severe, pervasive and objectively offensive** that it effectively denies Complainant equal access to the recipient's education program or activity

Sexual Harassment Defined, Cont.

Conduct on the ***basis of sex*** under one of following:

3. Other Sexual Acts

- **Sexual assault** per 20 U.S.C. 1092(f)(6)(A)(v): Includes Forcible and Nonforcible Sex Offenses
- **Dating violence** per 34 U.S.C. 12291(a)(10)
- **Domestic violence** per 34 U.S.C. 12291(a)(8)
- **Stalking** per 34 U.S.C. 12291(a)(30)

Other Sexual Acts as Sexual Harassment under Title IX

1. Sexual Assault

– Forcible:

- Any sexual act directed against Complainant, forcibly, against Complainant's will, or without consent, including rape, sodomy, sexual assault with an object, and fondling

– Nonforcible:

- Offenses that do not involve force where the Complainant is incapable of giving consent, including statutory rape and incest

Other Sexual Acts

2. Dating Violence (34 U.S.C. 12291(a)(10))

- Violence (on the basis of sex) committed by Respondent:
 - who is or has been in a social relationship of a romantic or intimate nature with the Complainant; and
 - where the existence of such a relationship shall be determined based on a consideration of the following factors:
 - (i) The length of the relationship
 - (ii) The type of relationship
 - (iii) The frequency of interaction between the persons involved in the relationship

Other Sexual Acts

3. Domestic Violence (34 U.S.C. 12291(a)(8))

Felony or misdemeanor crimes of violence (on the basis of sex) committed by:

- A current or former spouse or intimate partner of the Complainant
- A person with whom the Complainant shares a child in common
- A person who is cohabitating with or has cohabitated with the Complainant as a spouse or intimate partner
- A person similarly situated to a spouse of the Complainant under the domestic or family violence laws of the jurisdiction receiving grant monies, or
- Any other person against an adult or youth Complainant who is protected from that person's acts under the domestic or family violence laws of the jurisdiction.

Other Sexual Acts

4. Stalking (34 U.S.C. 12291(a)(30))

The term “stalking” means engaging in a course of conduct (on the basis of sex) directed at Complainant that would cause a reasonable person to:

- **Fear** for their safety or the safety of others; or
- Suffer substantial **emotional distress**

INTAKE PROCESS FOR REPORTS OF SEXUAL HARASSMENT

Meeting with Complainant

The Title IX Coordinator:

- Promptly schedules a meeting with Complainant and listens to allegations and concerns
- If Complainant describes sexual harassment allegations, the Title IX Coordinator explains the Title IX grievance process
- Informs Complainant of the right to file or **not** to file a formal complaint and the right to supportive measures even if a formal complaint is not filed
- If **no** formal complaint is filed, the Title IX Coordinator informs Complainant of right to file a formal complaint at a later time. The Title IX Coordinator also assesses, despite Complainant's decision, whether to independently initiate a complaint if the failure to initiate an investigation would be clearly unreasonable considering the circumstances (e.g. based on a safety threat)

Meeting with Complainant

The Title IX Coordinator:

- If a formal complaint is filed, Title IX Coordinator gathers the signature of Complainant, parent/guardian and/or Title IX Coordinator
- Informs Complainant of right to request an informal resolution process after submission of a formal complaint and the right to exit informal resolution process at any time
- If a formal complaint is filed, Title IX Coordinator determines if the complaint falls within the scope of mandatory dismissal and informs Complainant and Respondent
- Best practice to provide a written summary of the meeting

Supportive Measures

1. Requirement to Offer Supportive Measures per §106.30 & §106.44

- Must be offered to Complainant as soon as District has notice of possible Title IX issue and to Respondent after complaint filed

2. Avoid Burden on Parties

- Supportive Measures must be non-punitive, non-disciplinary, and not unreasonably burdensome to the other party

3. Individualized

- Supportive Measures must ensure equal educational access, protect safety, and/or deter sexual harassment

4. Examples of Supportive Measures

- Counseling, course-related adjustments, modify schedule, extend deadlines, campus escort, increased security and monitoring, and/or mutual restrictions on contact between the parties

Discuss Advisor of Choice

- The Title IX regulations provide the Complainant and Respondent with the same opportunities to have “others present” during any grievance proceeding
 - An advisor may be a parent, family member, attorney, or other person
 - The advisor may be present for any meeting, interview, and hearing and may inspect and review any evidence obtained as part of the investigation
 - The advisor may assist with a written cross-examination process and **shall** ask the cross-examination questions if recipient opts for a live hearing process
 - If a party does not have an advisor to conduct cross-examination at a live hearing, the institution must provide one to the party
 - The institution may establish restrictions on the extent of an advisor’s participation, if restrictions apply equally to both parties

Emergency Removal Option for Students

1. Institution may remove Respondent per §106.44(c)
2. Institution must undertake individualized safety & risk analysis re Respondent
 - The analysis determines if there is an *immediate threat to the physical health or safety* of any student or other individual arising from the allegations to justify removal
3. Notice to Respondent of Emergency Removal
4. Opportunity for Respondent to challenge decision immediately following the removal
5. Process **cannot** modify Respondent rights under IDEA, Section 504, or ADA

Administrative Leave Option

1. Institution may place a non-student employee Respondent on administrative leave, per §106.44(d) during the pendency of a grievance process that complies with §106.45
2. This administrative leave option cannot be construed to modify any rights under Section 504 or the Americans with Disabilities Act.

TITLE IX GRIEVANCE PROCESS

Grievance Process

1. Basic Requirements
2. Notice of Allegations
3. Dismissal of Formal Complaint
4. Consolidation
5. Investigation
6. Written Questions Between Parties
7. Determination of Responsibility
8. Appeals
9. Informal Resolution
10. Recordkeeping

Basic Requirements

1. Per §106.45(b)(1)(i), treat Complainant and Respondent equitably in the grievance process and related to remedies and sanctions, if any
2. Require objective evaluation of all relevant evidence, including inculpatory and exculpatory evidence
3. Cannot make credibility decisions based on a person's status as Complainant, Respondent, or witness
4. Presume that Respondent is not responsible until a determination is made
5. Follow prompt time frames (estimate 60-90 days)
6. State a standard of evidence (preponderance or clear and convincing). Most K-12 use preponderance of evidence

Notice of Allegations

- **Provide Notice of Allegations to Each Party**
 - **Notice of the institution’s grievance process and informal resolution process**
 - Identification of relevant Board Policies & Administrative Regulations which contain the grievance process and informal resolution process
 - Identification of standard of evidence
 - Right to inspect and review evidence
 - **Notice of allegations with sufficient details, including:**
 - Identification of the parties
 - Description of alleged conduct allegedly constituting sexual harassment and the date and location of alleged incident
 - **Review Sample Notice of Allegations**

Notice of Allegations

- **Provide Notice of Allegations to Each Party, continued**

- **Additional Items in Notice of Allegations:**

- Identification of potential policy violations (not just Title IX)
- Identification of the range of possible disciplinary sanctions and remedies
- Statement that Respondent is presumed not responsible
- Notification that a determination of responsibility will be made at the conclusion of the grievance process
- Notification that each party may have an advisor of choice, who may be an attorney
- Prohibition against parties knowingly making false statements or knowingly submitting false information

Notice of Allegations

- **If additional allegations are discovered, provide written Notice of *Additional Allegations***
- **Provide written notice of any changes in the process, including:**
 - Delays
 - Meetings
 - Interviews
 - Hearings
 - Appeals
 - Decisions
 - Other

Dismissal of Formal Complaint

- **Required Dismissal per §106.45(b)(3)**
 - Recipient **must** dismiss the formal complaint *if* the conduct alleged :
 - Would not constitute sexual harassment as defined in §106.30 even if proved
 - Did not occur in the recipient's education program or activity
 - Did not occur against a person in the United States
 - Such dismissal does **not** preclude action under another provision of recipient's Code of Conduct, Board Policy/Administrative Regulation or California law

Dismissal of Formal Complaint

- **Permissive Dismissal per §106.45(b)(3)**
 - Recipient **may** dismiss the formal complaint or allegations any time during the investigation or hearing, *if* :
 - The Complainant notifies the Title IX Coordinator in writing to withdraw the complaint
 - The Respondent is no longer enrolled or employed
 - Special circumstances prevent the recipient from gathering evidence in order to reach a determination
- **All dismissals require written notice & reasons delivered to the parties at the same time**

Consolidation of Formal Complaints

- **A recipient may consolidate formal complaints as to allegations of sexual harassment where the allegations arise out of the same facts or circumstances**
 - Against more than one Respondent;
 - By more than one complainant against one or more respondents; or
 - By one party against the other party (cross-claims)

Investigation

1. Presumption

- The institution must presume Respondent is *not responsible* for the alleged conduct

2. Evidence Gathering

- Investigator for the educational institution has the burden to gather sufficient evidence; the burden to gather evidence is not on the Complainant or Respondent
- Investigator cannot gather privileged information without voluntary, written consent (e.g., physician or psychiatrist records, etc.)

3. Written Notice with Time to Prepare

- Provide written notice for all interviews with sufficient time for the party to prepare to participate

Investigation, continued

4. Equal Opportunity for Parties

- To present witnesses, including fact & expert witnesses and other inculpatory and exculpatory evidence
- To have an advisor present for any meeting, interview or hearing

5. No “Gag” Orders or Directives

- Cannot restrict the ability of the Complainant or Respondent to discuss the allegations under investigation or to gather and present relevant evidence
- Likely can direct parties and witnesses not to tamper with evidence

Investigation, continued

6. Equal Opportunity to Inspect and Review Evidence

- Provide parties with opportunity to meaningfully respond to the evidence *before* the conclusion of the investigation.
- Parties may review evidence that is directly related to the allegations, including evidence which the investigator does *not* intend to rely upon as well as inculpatory and exculpatory evidence regardless of where it was obtained

Investigation, continued

7. Prepare and Share Draft Report of Evidence

- Before completing the Investigative Report, provide a ***Draft Report of Evidence and Attachments*** to both parties and their advisor, if any, via electronic format or a hard copy.
- Provide the parties and advisors, if any, with at least 10 days to review the Draft Report of Evidence and Attachments & submit written responses
- Share any new evidence with the parties and continue the investigation related to new information, if needed
- Consider and incorporate new information and responses in the ***Final Investigative Report***

Investigation, continued

8. Investigator Prepares Final Investigative Report

- Fairly summarize relevant evidence
- Relevant evidence may include credibility assessments

9. Provide Investigative Report to Parties

- At least 10 days prior to a hearing or other time of determination regarding responsibility, send the investigative report to each party and the party's advisor, if any, in an electronic format or a hard copy, for their review and written response
- Review written response, revise if needed, and attach written response to the Investigative Report

Written Questions Between Parties

Before making a decision, the Decision-Maker will facilitate:

1. Written Questions (e.g., Written Cross Examination)

- ***With or without a hearing***, after the investigator has sent the investigative report to the parties and before the decision-maker(s) has reached a determination regarding responsibility, the decision-maker(s) must afford ***each party the opportunity to submit written, relevant questions that a party wants asked of any party or witness***, provide each party with the answers, and allow for additional, limited follow-up questions from each party.

- The decision-maker(s) must explain any decision to exclude questions as not relevant

2. Rape Shield Protections

– ***With or without a hearing***, evidence about Complainant's prior sexual behavior is ***irrelevant*** unless offered to prove someone else committed the conduct or if offered to prove consent

Determination of Responsibility

1. Decision-Maker Determines Responsibility per §106.45(b)(7):

- Decision-maker must be trained to rule on relevance of questions and repetitive questions
- Must understand the “preponderance of the evidence” or “clear and convincing evidence” standard
- Reminder: The Title IX Coordinator or investigator cannot determine responsibility

2. Written Decision

- The written decision must include the findings of fact, conclusion, and the rationale.
- If the Decision-Maker finds responsibility, the written decision should include recommendations for disciplinary sanctions for Respondent, remedies to the Complainant, and how to file an appeal

Appeals

1. Equal Opportunity for Appeal under §106.45(b)(8)

- Both parties must have opportunity to appeal
 - the determination of responsibility, or
 - the dismissal of a formal complaint or allegations

2. Bases for Appeal

- Procedural irregularity that affected the outcome;
- New evidence that was not reasonably available & could have affected outcome; or
- Conflict of interest or bias generally or specifically by Title IX Coordinator, investigator, and/or decision-maker that affected the outcome

Note: Institution may include other bases for appeal if both parties have equal right to use

Informal Resolution Process

1. Optional Process per §106.45(b)(9)

- May use informal resolution process on a case-by-case basis after formal complaint is filed

2. Informed, Mutual Consent

- Both parties must give voluntary, informed, and written consent but cannot be required as a condition of enrollment/employment

3. Right to Withdraw from Informal Process

- Either party can withdraw from informal process at any time and resume formal process

4. Not Suitable for Student vs. Employee Matters

- No informal process for allegations that an *employee* harassed a student

Recordkeeping

1. A recipient must maintain records for 7 years, including records of:

– Each sexual harassment investigation, including:

- Determination regarding responsibility
- Audio or audiovisual recording or transcript, if any, for K-12
- Any disciplinary sanctions imposed on Respondent, if applicable
- Any remedies provided to Complainant, if applicable

Recordkeeping

2. A recipient must maintain records for 7 years, including records of:

- Any appeal and the result of the appeal
- Any informal resolution and the result of the informal process
- All materials used to train Title IX Coordinators, investigators, decision-makers, appeal officers, and any person who facilitates an informal resolution process
 - These training materials must be publicly available on the institution's website
 - If no website, training materials must be available upon request for inspection by the public

Recordkeeping

3. For each response required under §106.44, a recipient must create and maintain records for 7 years, including records of:

- Any actions, including supportive measures, taken in response to a report or formal complaint of sexual harassment.
 - If the recipient did not provide supportive measures, it must document why that decision was not clearly unreasonable in light of the known circumstances
- In each instance, recipient must document
 - Why its response was not deliberately indifferent
 - The measures taken which were designed to restore or preserve equal access to the education program or activity

RETALIATION

Retaliation

1. Section 106.71(a) – Retaliation Prohibited

- No recipient or other person may intimidate, threaten, coerce, or discriminate against any individual for the purpose of interfering with any right or privilege secured by Title IX or because the individual has made a report or complaint, testified, assisted, or participated or refused to participate in an investigation, proceeding, or hearing.

2. Avoiding the Title IX Process May Be Retaliation

- If the alleged behavior falls under Section 106.30 definitions, a recipient cannot use the student conduct process as a way to avoid the rigorous Title IX grievance procedures; such a decision may constitute retaliation.

3. Retaliation Complaints Filed Under Same Process

- Retaliation complaints must be filed under the Section 106.8 grievance process.

Retaliation, Continued

4. Confidentiality Required by Recipient

- Recipient must keep identity of Complainant, Respondent, and witness(es) confidential unless required by law “or as necessary to carry out Title IX proceeding”
- Regulations imply that the improper release of this confidential information could be retaliation

5. First Amendment Rights

- Parties exercising their 1st Amendment rights does not constitute retaliation under Section 106.71(a)

6. False Statement Charge

- Recipient charging an individual with making a false statement in bad faith during Title IX process is **not** retaliation
- A responsibility determination (or no responsibility determination) is not sufficient evidence to conclude there was a bad faith false statement

Disclaimer

This AALRR is intended for informational purposes only and should not be relied upon in reaching a conclusion in a particular area of law. Applicability of the legal principles discussed may differ substantially in individual situations. Receipt of this or any other AALRR presentation/publication does not create an attorney-client relationship. The Firm is not responsible for inadvertent errors that may occur in the publishing process.

©2020 Atkinson, Andelson, Loya, Ruud & Romo

